

Town of Haymarket – Council Session of March 5, 2012  
15000 Washington Street-Haymarket, Virginia 20169  
Mayor Pamela E. Stutz

---

## Call to Order

Mayor Stutz calls the meeting to order at 7:00 pm

## Roll Call

Tobias, Leake, Cole, Stutz, Scarbrough, Kenworthy, Weir

## Citizen's Time

### Heather Ring-Greenhill Crossing

She noticed on the agenda the appropriations for the Hulfish House, and then noticed the title search item was way down lower on the agenda. She thinks the title search and the appropriations of monies for the buildings should be discussed at the same time since they go hand in hand.

### Ralph Ring-Greenhill Crossing

Thanks to David Leake the citizens of Haymarket now know what the Town's plan is for the Hulfish house. As Mr. Leake delineated last meeting it is "Spend money, make money". Thank you Mr. Leake for enlightening the Town residents. Does the Council realize how ludicrous its four word plan appears? Let's break this down. Part one, Spend money. The Town is going to spend an unknown amount of money over an unknown period of time to place the structure in an unknown final condition. The historical accuracy of the final condition is unknown.

Part two, Make money. An unknown tenant or succession of tenants will pay an unknown amount of rent for an unknown period of time to recoup the unknown expense.

Let me not phrase it as a question this time. The Council's plan is ludicrous. More than that though, it is the height of fiscal irresponsibility on the part of the steward's of Haymarket's tax dollars. Let's examine part two of the plan in a little greater depth. The council has expressed numerous times that the Town's history is, or at least will be, a tangible, financial asset. At the last Town meeting it became clear, at least to me, that the council lacks an awareness of the town's history. When I pointed out that the documents used by the Town conflicted with each other, among other things, as to who the first mayor was, current Mayor Stutz said she was going to ask Ellie why she though G.A. was the first mayor. G.A. was the first mayor. This is well documented but not by any artifact cited in the PIF. John Cole said he had seen a deed that proved that a Hulfish owned the house. I believe his statement was "that's history, that's good enough for me." History by proclamation is very seldom pretty, or accurate. There are any number of words that can be used to describe the council's reaction to the possibility that G.A. married his cousin that was living under his roof. None of them are complimentary though.

Plan Part Two, Making money. How is the Council going to turn any version of Haymarket's history into money? This history which is not clearly documented, not fully fleshed out, and has no real appeal even to the vast majority of its own residents. To me it seems the plan relies on an additional five words. "And here, a miracle happens". I've seen no miracles in Haymarket.

Maybe I'm mistaken, Councilman Leake is the one that delineated the Town Council's plan. If the Council has an actual plan could the Council share that with Haymarket's tax payers? By actual I mean a plan with the rudimentary components, a budget, a time line, an end state. Replace some of the unknowns with calculated, projected values and definitions. A realistic path to success, not a spurious leap of faith. Residents on both sides of the issue have been asking for the Council's plan for months.

I've skimmed this month's council package, it's still ad hoc spending without a plan. It seems the town is getting an historian to do unspecified research. Nice but the council has already spent

**Town of Haymarket – Council Session of March 5, 2012**  
**15000 Washington Street-Haymarket, Virginia 20169**  
**Mayor Pamela E. Stutz**

---

tens of thousands of dollars without a sound historical footing, I doubt the council will abate spending awaiting research. As I asked last time what happens if you do find warts, is the building going to be able to demand premium rent then? Amongst all of the unknowns around this project there is one thing that is known the Council is eager to lavish tax payer's money upon this project.

**Chuck Carnahan-6654 Hunting Path Road**

He will echo again what he has said for 12 years "Show me a plan"; Mr. Carnahan asks about a meeting between Town officials and the School Board regarding the disposition of PACE West Elementary School. Mayor and Council respond that they are not aware of any such meeting.

## **Old Post Office**

Town Manager believes that we will still come in way under what the Council has appropriated for this project [\$200,000]. We had hoped to put an ADA compliant addition on the back of the building. There really isn't enough room there, so we would like to put it in the building. A ramp will be installed in the rear of the building to accommodate.

Weir asks for a scope of work from the prospective tenant, what their share will be? The Town Manager says they have committed about \$24,000, verbally. This would be offset in rent payments. Weir asks if we have talked square footage with them yet. Town Manager responds just generally, the town is renting \$18-\$23 square up and down Washington Street.

Mayor asks if ROI's have been done. The Town Manager responds that the Treasurer has been working on an ROI but it's only as good as the numbers that are plugged in. Mayor asks how good the numbers are. The Town Manager the numbers are fairly close. Tobias responds that he has done an ROI. Mr. Hall took the numbers that we have compared those to his prior experiences. He thinks we are very close on the numbers. He comments that the building is in better shape than he had anticipated. He compares the project to a piece of art. Tobias asks if the roof, doors, windows will be kept in "period" with the building. He is hoping to have a master picture done by our next meeting.

**Leake motions to authorize the Town Manager to spend \$174,500 from the Capital Improvements Project Town Center Property line item for the renovation of the Old Post Office, Cole seconds;**

**Tobias-Yes, Leake-Yes, Cole-Yes, Scarbrough-Yes, Kenworthy-Yes, Weir-Yes**

Mayor comments that she is hearing favorable responses from residents about the work being done on the two buildings.

## **Hulfish House**

The county historian agreed to perform the requested title work at no cost to the Town, he has done a chain of title and it is provided tonight (attached). Tobias is concerned that we did not engage a properly licensed title company.

All non load bearing walls have been removed. The foundation walls are in pretty good shape. The recommendation is that we move ahead with the renovation from the outside in and make it look good. Mr. Hall comments that it is much better condition that he had first thought. Leake

Town of Haymarket – Council Session of March 5, 2012  
15000 Washington Street-Haymarket, Virginia 20169  
Mayor Pamela E. Stutz

---

asks about the conditions, which one is in better shape? He believes the Hulfish House is in better condition structural wise, he feels it will cost less to fix the framing at the Hulfish House.

**Leake motions to authorize the Town Manager to spend \$139,100 to renovate the Hulfish House; fund are authorized from the previously appropriated funds from the Capital Improvements Project-Town Center Property line item, Cole seconds;**

**Discussion:**

Weir comments that he has heard over and over that everyone is in favor of renovation. That is not the case, 15-1 the residents want the building razed. We at least have a step by step on the Old Post Office; we have nothing on the Hulfish House. He can't imagine throwing more money at this. He will not be part of this. **Cole:** A Return on Investment on a hole in the ground is zero. You can't put a number on historical value. Preserving the town's history has value, but he can't put a dollar figure on it. The petition holds no weight with him because he has no idea what was said to residents when their signatures were obtained. In his view point, restore it from the outside in; let's make it look good first. **Leake:** The Hulfish House is an asset; the money we are spending is increasing the value of that asset. **Kenworthy:** We need a plan. **Tobias:** The amount of money in the motion is to allocate the rest of the money that we had appropriated for the complete renovation and repair, yet the next steps are only to shore up the outside. Why is council willing to spend these funds when we don't have a plan for this building? There is continued interest in the Old Post Office but no interest in the Hulfish House; we don't have a time frame for these repairs. How is this project going to move forward? He would like to see the quality of work we are getting at the Old Post Office before spending funds on the same contractor for the Hulfish House. **Weir:** Responds to Cole; he doesn't want it to be a hole in the ground; he would like to see it become a parking lot. He thinks we should take care of more pressing issues like taking care of our water problem here on site; there is any number of ways to spend this money wisely. 143 people signed that petition in favor of demolition, and he is confident they read the petition before they signed it. **Tobias:** We have a list of Capital Improvement items that Town Manager has put together that are more necessary now rather than later. This makes no sense to him.

**Tobias-No, Leake-Yes, Cole-Yes, Scarbrough-Yes, Kenworthy-No, Weir-No**

**Mayor breaks tie with Yes**

**Motion Passes**

## **Building Official – James Lowery, Jr.**

He has gone one step further with Prince William County regarding the permit fee collection and is confident the County's system is properly identifying Town addresses.

\*\*Clerk to send Weir updated Alexandra's Keep proffers

## **Police Report - Deputy Chief Breeden**

Weir asks why we are writing warning tickets.

Tobias asks about the enforcement of no parking on Hunting Path, he would like to see more tickets issued because people are still parking there.

## **Treasurer's Report – James Naradzay**

It appears that is going to be a surplus of income in FY 2012. There were no emails from Council regarding the proposed FY 2013 Budget. The Mayor suggests we have an open budget work session. Work session is set for Monday, March 19 @ 7pm.

Town of Haymarket – Council Session of March 5, 2012  
15000 Washington Street-Haymarket, Virginia 20169  
Mayor Pamela E. Stutz

---

\*\*Town Manager to work with Town Treasurer to obtain bids on professional services that are contracted by the Town. The Town Attorney comments that he doesn't know how you bid out the Town Attorney position.

**Closed Session** 8:15 p.m.-9:20 p.m.

\*\*\*\*\*

**Tobias motions to enter into closed session pursuant to VA §2.2-3711 A(3) for discussion or consideration of the acquisition of real property for a public purpose, or of the disposition of publicly held real property, where discussion in an open meeting would adversely affect the bargaining position or negotiating strategy of the public body, namely the lease with ATTIVA Corporation & the lease with QBE, LLC, Weir seconds;**

**Tobias-Yes, Leake-Yes, Cole-Yes, Scarbrough-Yes, Kenworthy-Yes, Weir-Yes, Stutz-Yes**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Tobias motions that the Council of the Town of Haymarket does hereby certify that to the best of each member's knowledge, only public business matters lawfully exempt from the open meeting requirements by Virginia law were discussed in the closed session, to which this certification applies, and only such public business matters as were identified in the motion convening the closed session were heard, discussed or considered by Council, Scarbrough seconds;**

**Tobias-Yes, Leake-Yes, Cole-Yes, Scarbrough-Yes, Kenworthy-Yes, Weir-Yes, Stutz-Yes**

**Town Manager's Report – Gene Swearingen**

- **I-66 Widening-Holly Montague, Town Engineer**  
VDOT is finalizing the sound wall plans for the widening of I-66. It is definitely crossing all of the Town properties. Final sound wall locations will be part of the environmental documents. We will post a link on our web site. The public will have 15 days to comment.  
\*\*Clerk to send the information to the HOA's.
- **I-66/Route 15 Interchange Improvements – Holly Montague, Town Engineer**  
Citizen's Information Meeting 5pm-7:30pm at Battlefield High School on March 22, 2012. This will include the original 7 layouts. This is the first public meeting. There will be a public hearing in the fall of 2012. \*\*Forward notice to council. VDOT has committed to aesthetic improvements. They want a decision on the preferred alternative by April 15. \*\*April 2 Town Engineer will ask for any more recommendations
- **Town Center Design**  
Façade on the main building/parking lot/green space. His concern is that if we do them all as pieces it won't look like what we want. He is suggesting that we take a step back and do a master design of the Town Center Property. He would like permission from council to seek proposals
- **Streetscape**  
VDOT approved and cleared the Town to proceed with utility relocation. Work will start sometime in April. Mayor would like us to inform the public well in advance.
- **Pedestrian Signal** Washington/Jefferson  
VDOT has agreed to move forward with the design without the right of entry time. There is no date



Ms. Preli - Here is the results of my research on the chain of title for the Hulfish House. I have no doubt that it was owned by George A. Hulfish between 1871 and 1903, and that his home was constructed there in 1872-73. My documentation follows. Hope it answers the Council's questions. If you need additional information, please let me know.

Sincerely,

**Donald L. Wilson, Virginia Librarian,**  
Ruth E. Lloyd Information Center  
for Genealogy and Local History (RELIC),  
Prince William Public Library System,  
Bull Run Regional Library,  
8051 Ashton Avenue, Manassas, VA 20110-2892  
703-792-4540  
[www.pwcgov.org/government/dept/library/RELIC](http://www.pwcgov.org/government/dept/library/RELIC)

**HULFISH HOUSE**  
**15000 Washington Street, Haymarket, Virginia**

1971 Real Estate Atlas: Tax map 132-2-74 owned by James R. Gossom. DB 197:199. Assessed at \$500 for land, \$4950 improvements, \$5450 total.

DB 197:199. 6 Jan. 1956. Albert H. Utterback and Doyal H. Utterback his wife to James R. Gossom. \$10 and other consideration. Lot on west side of Carolina Road and 12 ft. on John Marshall Highway, bounded by C. J. Gillis, W. R. Gossom, J. W. Barrett (formerly J. W. Dunbar), the drug store property owned by the Bank of Haymarket, Carolina Road and John Marshall Highway. Same conveyed to C. D. S. Clarkson and one E. R. Rector by S. W. Bean et al, Nov. 10, 1911 (62:96), except ... by E. R. Rector to N. S. Rector, 1912 (62:99), parcel conveyed to Albert H. Utterback 1938 (100:285).

DB 100:285. 20 Mar. 1938. C.D.S. Clarkson and wife Helen M. J. Clarkson to Albert H. Utterback. \$10 and other consideration. Bounded by lands of C. J. Gilliss, W. R. Gossom, J. W. Garrett (formerly J. W. Dunbar), drugstore property owned by Bank of Haymarket (formerly by H. R. Bragg) and by Carolina Road and John Marshall Highway. Conveyed to C. D. S. Clarkson and one E. R. Rector by S. W. Bean et al., Nov. 10, 1911 (62:96), except portion by parties of 1st part and E. R. Rector to N. S. Rector, Feb. 17, 1912 (62:99).

DB 62:96. 10 Nov. 1911. S. W. Bean and Mattie J. Bean his wife, and Thos. H. Lion commissioner, to C. D. S. Clarkson and E. R. Rector, all of PWC. Whereas on 5 Oct. 1911 it was decreed by circuit court in chancery between Mattie J. Bean etc. et al complainants and Ardie O. Bean et al, respondents, that said Thos. H. Lion by and with the consent of S. W. Bean and Mattie J. Bean his wife who was thereby appointed commissioner for the purpose, would convey the real estate mentioned in the cause, \$4000 purchase price, parcel which said S. W. Bean is seized, west side of Carolina Road, adjoins the sd. turnpike, land of H. R. Bragg, and J. W. Dunbar, the same consisting of store house and lot, dwelling house and lot, barn and lot, and all lying and being one body and being part of real estate conveyed to S. W. Bean by G. A. Hulfish and Anna L. his wife by deed 1 Nov. 1903 (52:177), being a portion of the second lot or parcel described in said deed from Hulfish to Bean. Signed: S. W. Bean, Mattie J. Bean, Thos. H. Lion.

1910 plat of Haymarket (frontispiece to *Haymarket: a Town in Transition*) shows "Bean" as owning two lots along west side of Jefferson Street, north of Washington Street. (Same as lots 50 and 63 of the original plat.)

DB 52:177. 1 Nov. 1903. George A. Hulfish and Anna L. his wife to S. W. Bean, for \$11,000 cash. Following: (1) a tract near Haymarket, 240.1 acres on Carolina Road made up of several parcels (see deeds 39:223, 37:471, 36:465, 51:52). (2) All real estate they own in Haymarket on both sides of Carolina Road at junction with turnpike (store house lot, dwelling house lot, and barn lot on west side of Carolina Road; and warehouse lot and Eva Mason lot on east side of road. Were conveyed by deeds: from W. W. Sinclair (28:234), Otto Wittichen attorney in fact (30:347),

T. A. Smith and others (31:516), Eva Mason and husband (34:452). Not encumbered except for deed of trust upon the 240.1 acre tract. Signed: G. A. Hulfish, Anna L. Hulfish.

DB 28:234. 24 Apr. 1871. William W. Sinclair of Washington, D.C., to G. A. Hulfish of PWC. For \$190. Two lots of land in Town of Haymarket at corner of Jefferson and Washington streets, one beginning at corner of Jefferson and running with said street 124 ft NE, thence NW 175 ft, thence SW 125 ft to Washington Street, thence SE with Washington St. 125 ft to beginning. Other lot on Jefferson and Fox streets, adjacent the first lot, the one that was conveyed to Sarah E. Mount by Eppa Hunton commissioner in the suit of Sixsmith vs. Sixsmith and contains same quantity of land as first lot. Signed: William W. Sinclair.

The following three deeds do not concern the lots in question directly, but provide other information about G. A. Hulfish's real estate activities. The 1875 deed is evidence he was living on the 1871 property by that date.

DB 30:347. 29 Dec. 1875. Otto Wittichen as attorney in fact for Wm. Pratie [Gratje?] and as trustee under a deed of trust from said Wm. Pratie and as attorney in fact for Eugene Pratie of the one part, to G. A. Hulfish, both of PWC. Whereas Wm. Pratie by deed of trust 20 Aug. 1872 conveyed two certain tracts in PWC containing 38  $\frac{1}{4}$  ac. to Otto Wittichen to secure to said Eugene Pratie the debt therein recited and by power of attorney dated 16 Feb. 1874 made the said Otto Wittichen his attorney in fact, and where said Otto Wittichen has sold to said G. A. Hulfish 2 acres, part of tracts above mentioned and the said Otto Wittichen as trustee is willing to release the said 2 acres sold from the lien of the said deed of trust. \$225 paid by G. A. Hulfish to Otto Wittichen as trustee and attorney. Following land: joining the lot the said G. A. Hulfish owns and is living on, and running in the same width of the said lot on the Carolina Road to the north so as to make the mentioned 2 acres, taking in the ice house, the said G. A. Hulfish building himself to fence in the said two acres and to keep the fence up and the said Otto Wittichen warrants the sale. Signed: O. Wittichen, G. A. Hulfish.

DB 31:516. 4 June 1878. Wm. A. Bonnell [Powell?], 1st part; James P. Hulfish, 2nd part; both of PWC. First part justly indebted to George A. Hulfish for \$175.56 with interest, in two notes drawn by Bonnell in favor of George A. Hulfish, one dated 2 Sept. 1876 for \$64.05 and the other dated 12 Jan. (?) 1877 for \$106.50 and whereas Bonnell is desirous of securing this payment, now therefore for this premise and five dollars to him in hand paid, said W. A. Bonnell does convey to James P. Hulfish 25 of the choice or loss(?) sheep now in his possession in trust to secure to said George A. Hulfish the payment of the notes. Agreed that unless the said notes are paid off in a reasonable time, or when demanded by said George A. Hulfish that the trustees will sell at public auction for cash the before mentioned 25 head of sheep, after giving such notice as he may deem sufficient and the proceeds apply to payment of the notes. Signed: W. A. Bonnell.

DB 34:452. 11 Oct. 1880. William V. Mason and Eva his wife, to George A. Hulfish, all of PWC. [blank] dollars cash. A certain lot in village of Haymarket. Beginning at a stake in line of Miss Mary Sanders' lot, thence N 32  $\frac{1}{2}$  W 3 poles to another stake, thence N 58 degrees W 7  $\frac{3}{10}$  poles to stake, thence S 32 degrees W 7  $\frac{6}{10}$  poles to another stake, thence N 58 degrees W 26 poles to stake on S side of Carolina Road, thence with road N 30 degrees 10 poles to Smith lot, thence with Smith and Jordan's lots S 59 degrees E 25 poles to corner of Jordan's lot, thence with said lot N 32  $\frac{1}{2}$  degrees E 7  $\frac{2}{10}$  poles, thence S 58 degrees E 2  $\frac{3}{10}$  poles to beginning, containing 1 acre 3 roods & 11 poles, and being the lot which was allotted to Eva Mason in the division of real estate of her father the late C. C. Marsteller deceased. Signed: W. V. Mason, E. M. Mason.

1872 land tax list, Gainesville Township, town lots:

Sinclair, W. W., res. PWC [sic], fee [simple ownership], 2 lots, no. 63 and 50, Haymarket, no improvements, \$250 value, \$1.25 tax. "Transferred from Sarah and J. W. Mount to W. W. Sinclair and [by] him transferred to G. A. Hulfish."

1873 land tax list, Gainesville Township, town lots:

Hulfish, G. A., res. PWC, fee, 2 lots (63 and 50), Haymarket, \$650 improvements, \$850 total value, \$4.25 tax. "Increased in value on account of building."

1874 land tax list, Gainesville Township, town lots:

Hulfish, G. A., 2 lots (63 and 50), Haymarket, \$650 improv., \$850 total, \$4.25 tax.

1875 - Same.

1880 land tax list, First District [western half of PWC], town lots:

Hulfish, Geo. A., res. PWC, fee, 2 lots (50 and 63), Haymarket, \$1800 improvements, \$2000 total value, \$10.00 tax.  
"\$1000 added for buildings."

[Hulfish, Geo. A.], 1 lot, no improvements, \$250, \$1.25 tax.

1885 land tax list, First District, town lots:

Hulfish, G. A. trustee, trust, 1 lot (#19), no improvements, \$50 value, \$0.15 + \$0.05 tax.

Hulfish, G.A., fee, 2 lots (50 and 53 [sic]), \$1500 improvements, \$1700 total, \$5.10 + \$1.70 tax.

Hulfish, G. A., fee, 1 lot [not identified], not improved, \$250 value, \$0.75 + \$0.25 tax.

Hulfish, G. A., fee, 1 lot [not identified], \$350 improvements, \$450 total value, \$1.35 + \$0.45 tax.

1892 land tax list, Haymarket, town lots:

Hulfish, Geo. A., trustee, res. PWC, trust, 1 lot #19, not improved, \$50 value, \$0.08 + \$0.02+ \$0.10 tax.

Hulfish, Geo. A., fee, 2 lots (50 and 53), \$1500 improvements, \$1700 total value, \$5.10 +\$1.70 tax.

Hulfish, Geo. A., fee, 1 lot, no improvement, \$100 value, \$0.30 + \$0.10 tax.

Hulfish, Geo. A., fee, 1 lot, no improvement, \$50 value, \$0.15 +\$0.05 tax.

The documents we have found show:

- George A. Hulfish bought the property on the northwest corner of Jefferson and Washington on 24 April 1871. At that time there were no improvements on the land, identified as lots 63 and 50 in the town of Haymarket. This agrees with the numbering in the old plat of Haymarket.
- In 1872 the tax list shows that there were still no improvements (assessments were made in the early part of the year, about Feb.-May).
- By the spring of 1873 Hulfish had added improvements to his lots worth \$650, apparently his home. \$650 at that time would have paid for a medium-sized wood-frame house.
- The deed of December 1875 confirms that Hulfish is living on that lot.
- By the spring of 1880 (since the spring of 1879) he had added another \$1000 in improvements to the lot.
- He and his wife sold those lots in November 1903 to S. W. Bean. At that time there were a storehouse, a dwelling and a barn, each with a yard, on the lots.
- A photo submitted by the Hulfish family show the appearance of the house at the time of their residence there (ca. 1900), with the family in the yard.
- G. A. Hulfish was the first mayor of Haymarket, having been elected in 1882.